vacuum (emitting) surface. Electrons entering the film from the back contact can be heated (that is, enter energy states far from the conduction band edge) during transport to the vacuum (emitting) surface due to the high field within the film. The probability of electron emission will be high at the surface if such electron heating occurs, because the electrons are energetically closer to the vacuum level. This may explain the apparently low barrier obtained for the Fowler-Nordheim region in Fig. 1. For field emission from polymers, it appears that there is a small positive barrier-according to the Fowler-Nordheim relationship-before 'conditioning'. But after conditioning, the *I-F* data, when plotted in the Fowler-Nordheim axes, has no region indicating a negative slope. This indicates that field emission is no longer limited by a positive barrier at the polymer-vacuum interface. Possible limiting mechanisms are the flow of SCLC in the bulk of the film, or in the vacuum immediately above the emission spot.

The gradient of 1.8 obtained from the log *I*-log *V* plot of Fig. 2 does not make it clear whether one type of space-charge-limiting mechanism dominates over the other. A slope of 1.5 is predicted by the Langmuir-Child⁸ law for SCLC in a vacuum, and a slope of at least 2.0 is predicted for SCLC in the film bulk from the Lampert-Rose model⁹. We note that a very similar gradient value of \sim 1.75 has been measured for nitrogenated diamond³, which showed the lowest emission threshold field of any carbon-based material before the present results from conjugated polymers. It is known that C-H bonding in polymeric carbon materials can lead to negative electron affinity, as in the case of H-terminated diamond {111} and {100} surfaces¹⁰. The relative energies of the conduction band edge and the vacuum level are largely determinated by C-H bonding at the surface. We speculate that the conditioning in Fig. 1 reflects a change in polymer structure at the high-field sites from which electron emission originates. The concentration of carriers and electric field at these local emission sites could in principle lead to a significant rise in the local temperature. If the transformation of the polymer gives it a negative or very low electron affinity at the emission sites, then post-conditioning current characteristics similar to those of diamond would be expected¹¹.

The extremely low threshold field for electron emission in conjugated polymers offers the prospect of an all-polymer flatpanel display, in which polymer thin-film transistors are used for switching the pixels, and polymer field-emission cathodes stimulate light emission from phosphor screens.

Note added in proof: Since submission of this Letter, an electron emission process based on a triple junction effect at a diamond/ metal/vacuum interface has been proposed¹¹. Such a process may also be relevant for emission from the surface of the polymer void. \Box

Received 14 May; accepted 15 June 1998.

- Chalamala, B. R., Wei, Y. & Gnade, B. E. FED up with fat tubes (review of current technology). *IEEE Spectrum* 35, 42–51 (1998).
- Okano, K., Koizumi, S., Silva, S. P. & Amaratunga, G. A. J. Low-threshold cold cathodes made of nitrogen-doped chemical-vapour-deposited diamond. *Nature* 381, 140–141 (1996).
- Amaratunga, G. A. J. & Silva, S. R. P. Nitrogen containing hydrogenated amorphous carbon for thinfilm field emission cathodes. *Appl. Phys. Lett.* 68, 2529–2531 (1996).
- Bredas, J. L. Relationship between band-gap and bond length alternation in organic conjugated polymers. J. Chem. Phys. 82, 3808–3811 (1985).
- Nishino, H., Yu, G., Heeger, A. J., Chen, T.-A. & Rieke, R. D. Electroluminescence from blend films of poly(3-hexylthiophene) and poly(N-vinylcarbazole). Synth. Met. 68, 243–247 (1995).
- Chen, T.-A., Wu, X.-M. & Ricke, R. D. Regiocontrolled synthesis of poly(3-alkylthiophenes) mediated by Rieze zinc: their characterisation and solid state properties. J. Am. Chem. Soc. 117, 233–244 (1995).
- Fowler, R. H. & Nordheim, L. Electron emission in intense fields. Proc. R. Soc. Lond. A 119, 173–181 (1928).
- Anderson, W. A. Role of space charge in field emission cathodes. J. Vac. Sci. Technol. 11, 383–388 (1993).
- 9. Lampert, M. A. & Mark, P. Current Injection in Solids 44-46 (Academic, New York, 1970).
- Robertson, J. Band model for electron emission from diamond and diamond-like carbon. Symp. Proc. MRS 422, 777–782 (1996).
- 11. Geis, M. W. et al. Nature 393, 431-435 (1998).

Acknowledgements. We thank N. Rupasinghe for assistance during the measurements, M. Chhowalla for discussions, and K. Molloy for technical assistance. We also thank the UK Engineering and Physical Research Council for financial support through studentships.

Correspondence and requests for materials should be addressed to G.A.J.A. (e-mail: amaratun@liv.ac.uk).

Abiotic nitrogen reduction on the early Earth

Jay A. Brandes, Nabil Z. Boctor, George D. Cody, Benjamin A. Cooper, Robert M. Hazen & Hatten S. Yoder Jr

Geophysical Laboratory, Carnegie Institution of Washington, 5251 Broad Branch Road NW, Washington DC 20015-1305, USA

The production of organic precursors to life depends critically on the form of the reactants. In particular, an environment dominated by N₂ is far less efficient in synthesizing nitrogenbearing organics than a reducing environment rich in ammonia (refs 1, 2). Relatively reducing lithospheric conditions on the early Earth have been presumed to favour the generation of an ammonia-rich atmosphere, but this hypothesis has not been studied experimentally. Here we demonstrate mineral-catalysed reduction of N_2 , NO_2^- and NO_3^- to ammonia at temperatures between 300 and 800 °C and pressures of 0.1-0.4 GPa-conditions typical of crustal and oceanic hydrothermal systems. We also show that only N₂ is stable above 800 °C, thus precluding significant atmospheric ammonia formation during hot accretion. We conclude that mineral-catalysed N2 reduction might have provided a significant source of ammonia to the Hadean ocean. These results also suggest that, whereas nitrogen in the Earth's early atmosphere was present predominantly as N2, exchange with oceanic, hydrothermally derived ammonia could have provided a significant amount of the atmospheric ammonia necessary to resolve the early-faint-Sun paradox³.

To assess the extent to which N_2 might have been reduced to NH_3 via mineral-catalysed reduction, we have conducted a series of hightemperature, high-pressure experiments. If the early Earth's lithosphere was more reduced than it is today with a higher percentage of iron in the FeO state⁴, then reaction of this reduced iron with H_2O might have provided the necessary H_2 gas for N_2 reduction⁵. Furthermore, the reduction of N_2 to NH_3 might have been catalysed by iron oxides as these are used as the starting material for catalysts in industrial nitrogen reduction⁶. The first reaction considered was that of metallic iron with N_2 and H_2O to form NH_3 and iron oxides:

$$3(1-x)Fe + N_2 + 3H_2O \rightarrow 3Fe_{(1-x)}O + 2NH_3$$
 (1)

This reaction has been postulated to occur on the early Earth between metallic iron or reduced iron oxides within the lithosphere and degassing N₂ from the Earth's interior⁷. In the present experiments the ratio of H₂O to Fe in the sample capsules was varied to generate a range of conditions from highly reducing (H₂O:Fe = 1) to mildly reducing (H₂O:Fe~1 to 1.5) and oxidizing with excess H₂O (H₂O:Fe > 1.5). Under the most reducing conditions, at 700 °C and 0.1 GPa, up to 17 mol% of N₂ was reduced to NH₃, whereas under mildly reducing conditions 1–3% of N₂ was reduced (Fig. 1). Under the most oxidizing conditions with excess H₂O present, only trace amounts of N₂ were reduced to NH₃. Interestingly, no NH₃ was produced at 900 °C, even under the most reducing conditions, indicating the inherent thermodynamic instability of NH₃ at this high temperature.

To examine the system with more oxidized catalysts, experiments were conducted in N₂ atmosphere in which magnetite (Fe₃O₄) with formic acid was used as a reducing agent. It has long been established that, in the presence of a strong reductant (H₂ or hydride donor), pure synthetic magnetite acts as a catalyst for N₂ reduction⁶. Notably, magnetite is a major form of iron oxide in the present-day crust⁸. The potential for this reaction was explored with natural magnetite under geochemically relevant conditions spanning a range of temperatures and pressures. Yields of NH₃ for the Fe₃O₄/ N₂/HCO₂H system were comparable to those obtained under

letters to nature

equivalent reducing conditions from the Fe/N₂/H₂O system (Fig. 2). Although the temperature of maximum yield dropped to 500 °C, the upper thermal limit of reduction remained at ~900 °C. Increasing the pressure at 500 °C had only a small effect (from 0.53% at 0.1 GPa to 0.58% at 0.4 GPa) on NH3 yields. Low pressures (0.01 GPa) resulted in a marked decrease in NH₃ yields to less than 10% of comparable high-pressure values in both systems (Figs 1 and 2). In a similar manner to the Fe/H₂O system, N₂ reduction was strongly inhibited by excess water (Fig. 2). Most gas compositions in metamorphic systems have ratios of H₂O to total gas of 0.5 or greater⁹, although gases trapped in some mid-ocean ridge basalts have been shown to have very low ratios of H2O to total gas¹⁰. Thus, N₂ reduction would be restricted to localized regions from which H₂O had been removed by reaction with reduced minerals to form H₂ and oxides^{5,7}. A plausible scenario for the production of NH₃ in the crust involves the initial production of H₂ from the reaction of H₂O with reduced minerals, followed by the reduction of N₂ on the mineral surfaces. The high temperatures and pressures required in these experiments (0.1 GPa, 300-800 °C) are consistent with this hypothesis.

The fate of the more oxidized forms of nitrogen, NO_2^- and NO_3^- , presumed to be in the Hadean ocean¹¹ (generated by atmospheric reactions driven by electrical discharge or cometary shock¹²) was also investigated. These compounds are of interest because they represent an additional source of reactive nitrogen to the Hadean ocean, whereas hydrothermal systems have been suggested as a possible sink for oxidized nitrogen¹¹. Experiments were conducted in which NO₂ and NO₃ solutions were reacted with mineral catalysts at high temperatures and pressures. We find that NO₂ and NO_3^- in contact with iron sulphides are quickly and efficiently reduced to NH₃ at higher temperatures (Table 1). Reactions at 500 °C reached 80% conversion efficiency within the 15 minutes required to bring the pressure vessel up to constant temperature (Table 1). Pyrite was as efficient as pyrrhotite in catalysing the conversion of NO₃⁻ to NH₃ and no added reductant (H₂S or H₂) was required. Magnetite and basalt, however, did not catalyse the reaction to NH₃ as efficiently or as rapidly as iron sulphides. Both magnetite and basalt quickly (<15 min at 500 °C) converted NO₃ and NO₂⁻ to species that could not be detected as solutes in aqueous solution. After 24 hours, significant amounts of NH₃ were produced, although yields were not as great as those found with iron sulphides. We hypothesize that the pathway for this reaction¹³ proceeds through NO or NO2, not N2, on the basis of the difficulty of N₂ reduction in the presence of excess water. Reduction of NO₃⁻ does not appear to pass through NO₂⁻ (as it does in the biological pathway¹⁴), as yields of NH₃ from NO₃⁻ are higher than those from

NO₂⁻. Lower temperatures decreased the amount of conversion of nitrogen oxides to NH₃. The addition of reducing agents within hydrothermal systems, however, might improve the conversion efficiency at low temperatures¹⁵. Because iron sulphides are ubiquitous in hydrothermal systems, it is likely that both NO₂⁻ and NO₃⁻ carried into such systems are eventually converted into NH₃. After conversion, the NH₃ is quite stable, even at very high temperatures (700 °C). Only at T > 800 °C are both nitrogen oxides and NH₃ destroyed. Studies of hydrothermal systems indicate that high temperatures do not exceed 700 °C (ref. 16). Thus, hydrothermal systems represent regions of the highest NH₃ conversion rates and stability on the Earth.

Three important conclusions follow from this study. First, the instability of NH₃ at T > 800 °C strongly indicates that planetary bodies that undergo a 'hot accretionary' mechanism (including the Earth¹⁷) have their earliest atmospheres dominated by nitrogen in the N₂ form. Regardless of the degree to which the interior of the planet is reducing in nature, during the initial period of accretion where temperatures are above 800 °C no NH₃ will form and any NH₃ derived from the thermal decomposition of organic matter in chondrites¹⁸ will be converted to N₂. Indeed, most of the Archaean atmosphere is assumed to have formed under these conditions¹⁹. These results also indicate that surficial N₂ reduction would have been precluded by the high H₂O content and low pressures of the Hadean atmosphere. Thus it is likely that the very reducing conditions required for N₂ reduction would have been found only in high-pressure environments well beneath the Earth's surface.

Second, NH₃ produced by crustal N₂ reduction might have been an important source of reduced nitrogen to the Hadean ocean. After atmospheric formation a significant percentage of total Earth N is thought to have remained within the crust and mantle. Conversion of even a small percentage of this nitrogen to NH₃ after crustal temperatures dropped below 800 °C would have provided a vast reservoir of reduced nitrogen for the early Earth. The total nitrogen budget of the Earth's crust and atmosphere is estimated to be 2×10^{20} mol (ref. 19). Conservatively assuming that only 25% of the total nitrogen remained within the crust and mantle after initial atmosphere formation, and that of this only 1% was converted to NH₃, then it is calculated that a reservoir of 5×10^{17} mol N in reduced form would have resulted. In the absence of any losses or other inputs, this NH₃ was presumably transferred to the ocean from the crust by hydrothermal systems over timescales of 10^7 to 10^9 years. Such a source of ammonia would have been comparable in magnitude $(10^9 - 10^{11} \text{ mol N yr}^{-1})$ to the proposed oceanic reduction of NO₃⁻ by Fe²⁺ (ref. 11) and terrestrial TiO₂ photochemical catalysis of N₂ (ref. 20). Transfer of crustal ammonia to the ocean might



Figure 1 N₂ reduction to NH₃ plotted against initial Fe:H₂O ratio at 300, 500 and 700 °C. All reactions were conducted over a 24-h period. No detectable NH₃ was obtained in experiments conducted at 900 °C or in experiments conducted at 0.01 GPa and H₂O:Fe ratios larger than 0.5.



Figure 2 N₂ reduction to NH₃ plotted against temperature at 0.1 GPa in the HCO₂H/ N₂/Fe₃O₄ system (squares). Also shown are yields at 500 °C with different amounts of H₂O (given in mol%) added to the initial HCO₂H solution (circles). The 0.03% yield at 150 °C represents the blank concentration of NH₃. No detectable NH₃ above blank was obtained in experiments conducted at 0.01 GPa and 500 °C.

Table 1 Conversion efficiencies to NH_3 from NO_2^- and NO_3^- solutions in contact with catalysts

Mineral	Compound	<i>T</i> (°C)	Time (h)	Solution type	Product yield (%)
Fe _(1-x) S	NO ₃	300	24	H ₂ O	53
Fe _(1-x) S	NO_2^2	300	24	H ₂ O	21
Fe _(1-x) S	NO ₃	500	24	H ₂ O	73
Fe _(1-x) S	NO ₂	500	24	H ₂ O	37
Fe _(1-x) S	NO ₃	700	24	H ₂ O	89
Fe _(1-x) S	NO ₃	700	24	H ₂ O	74
Fe _(1-x) S	NO ₂	900	24	H ₂ O	0
Fe _(1-x) S	NO ₃	500	0.033	H ₂ O	74
FeS ₂	NO ₃	500	24	H ₂ O	70
95%Fe,5%Ni	NO ₃	500	24	H ₂ O	41
95%Fe,5%Ni	NO ₂	500	24	H ₂ O	45
Fe ₃ O ₄	NO ₃	900	24	H ₂ O	0
Fe ₃ O ₄	NO ₃	500	24	H ₂ O	46
Fe ₃ O ₄	NO ₂	500	24	H ₂ O	9.4
Fe ₃ O ₄	NO ₃	500	0.033	H ₂ O	4.1
Fe ₃ O ₄	NO ₂	500	0.033	H ₂ O	1.0
Basalt	NO ₃	500	24	H ₂ O	20
Basalt	NO ₂	500	24	H ₂ O	14
Fe _(1-x) S	NO ₃	500	24	Sea water	84
Fe ₃ O ₄	NO ₃	500	24	Sea water	1.2
Basalt	NO ₃	500	24	Sea water	1.0

therefore have provided an early boost to oceanic NH₃ concentrations, and thus improved the prospects for synthesis and stability of N-containing organic compounds²¹. The results discussed here point to a probably oceanic or hydrothermal source for a large fraction of reduced nitrogen. Steady-state oceanic NH₃ concentrations would have depended on atmospheric loss rates^{3,11}; locally, however, hydrothermal environments and adjacent waters would clearly have exhibited the highest NH₃ concentrations in the prebiotic world. After the genesis of life, hydrothermal environments would have continued to be oases, providing NH₃ to early life forms until the advent of enzymatic systems capable of reducing NO₃ and N₂ (ref. 22).

Last, these results on potential sources of ocean NH₃ must be factored into estimates of the NH₃ content of the Archaean atmosphere. Even low concentrations of atmospheric NH₃ could be of great importance to photolytically driven organic synthesis¹. Furthermore, Sagan and Chyba³ have demonstrated that an atmospheric mixing ratio of 10^{-5} for ammonia would have been sufficient, through greenhouse warming, to resolve the early-faint-Sun paradox. Maintenance of this mixing ratio over the first 10^{9} years of the Earth would have required a supply of 1.4×10^{18} g NH₃ (ref. 3). These results indicate that mineral-catalysed synthesis of NH₃ could have met at least one-third of this requirement, with the possibility that all of the necessary supply could have been produced in this manner if one assumes a highly reducing lithosphere during the Hadean.

Methods

All experiments were run in sealed, N₂-purged, acid-washed, pure gold tubes. Iron sulphide and iron-metal catalysts were prepared from semiconductorgrade metals and pure elemental sulphur, with elemental compositions verified by ion-probe analysis. Magnetite catalyst was a very pure natural sample of fumarolic origin²³, whereas the basalt used was a natural alkali basalt (65992, ref. 28). Solution phases added to N₂ reduction capsules were either distilled deionized water or mixtures of formic acid and water. Solutions phases for NO₃⁻ and NO₂⁻ were 5 mM in either distilled deionized water or low-nutrient sea water. Tubes were loaded, purged with N₂ gas, welded shut and incubated in an internally heated pressure vessel under argon-medium^{24,25}. Tubes were opened, extracted with distilled water and analysed for NO₃⁻, NO₂⁻ and NH₃ by spectrophotometric methods^{26,27}.

Received 25 February; accepted 13 July 1998.

- Schlesinger, G. & Miller, S. L. Prebiotic synthesis in atmospheres containing CH₄, CO and CO₂. I. Amino acids. J. Mol. Evol. 19, 376–383 (1983).
- Stribling, R. & Miller, S. L. Energy yields for hydrogen cyanide and formaldehyde syntheses: the HCN and amino acid concentrations in the primitive ocean. Origins Life Evol. Biosph. 17, 261–273 (1987).

- Sagan, C. & Chyba, C. The early faint sun paradox: organic shielding of ultraviolet-labile greenhouse gases. *Science* 276, 1217–1221 (1997).
- Kasting, J. F., Eggler, D. H. & Raeburn, S. P. Mantle redox evolution and the oxidation state of the Archaean atmosphere. J. Geol. 101, 245–257 (1993).
- Berndt, M. E., Allen, D. E. & Seyfried, W. E. Jr Reduction of CO₂ during serpentization of olivine at 300 °C and 500 bar. *Geology* 24, 351–354 (1996).
- 6. Tamaru, K. in Catalytic Ammonium Synthesis (ed. Jennings, J. R.) 1–18 (Plenum, New York, 1991).
- Holland, H. D. *The Chemical Evolution of the Atmosphere and Oceans* (Princeton Univ. Press, 1984).
 Frost, B. R. Stability of oxide minerals in metamorphic rocks. *Rev. Minerol.* 25, 469–483 (1991).
- Frost, B. R. Stability of oxide minerals in metamorphic rocks. *Rev. Minerol.* 25, 469–483 (1991).
 Johnson, M. C., Anderson, A. T. Jr & Rutherford, M. J. Pre-eruptive volatile contents of magmas. *Rev. Minerol.* 30, 281–330 (1994).
- Javoy, M. & Pineau, F. The volatiles record of a 'popping' rock from the mid-Atlantic ridge at 14° N: chemical and isotopic composition of gas trapped in the vesicles. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* **107**, 598–611 (1991).
- Summers, D. P. & Chang, S. Prebiotic ammonia from reduction of nitrite by iron (II) on the early Earth. Nature 365, 630–632 (1990).
- Mancineli, R. L. & McKay, C. P. The evolution of nitrogen cycling. Origins Life Evol. Biosph. 18, 311– 326 (1990).
- Buresh, R. J. & Moraghan, J. T. Chemical reduction of nitrate by ferrous iron. J. Environ. Qual. 5, 320– 325 (1976).
- 14. Knowleds, R. Denitrification. Microbiol. Rev. 46, 43-70 (1982).
- Blöchl, E., Keller, M., Wachershauser, G. & Stetter, K. O. Reactions depending on iron sulfide and linking geochemistry with biochemistry. *Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. USA* 89, 8117–8120 (1992).
- 16. Fournier, R. O. Conceptual models of brine evolution in magmatic hydrothermal systems. US Geol. Surv. Prof. Pap. 1350, 1497–1506 (1987).
- 17. Stevenson, D. J. in Earth's Earliest Biosphere: Its Origin and Evolution (ed. Schopf, J. W.) 32-40 (Princeton Univ. Press, 1983).
- Pizzarello, S., Feng, X., Epstein, S. & Cronin, J. R. Isotopic analyses of nitrogenous compounds from the Murchinson meteorite; ammonia, amines, amino acids, and polar hydrocarbons. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* 58, 5579–5587 (1994).
- Zhang, Y. & Zindler, A. Distribution and evolution of carbon and nitrogen in Earth. Earth Planet. Sci. Lett. 117, 331–345 (1993).
- Henderson-Sellers, A. & Schwartz, A. W. Chemical evolution and ammonia in the early Earth's atmosphere. *Nature* 287, 526–528 (1980).
- Bada, J. L. & Miller, S. L. Ammonium ion concentration in the primitive ocean. Science 159, 423–425 (1968).
- 22. Falkowski, P. G. & Raven, J. in Aquatic Photosynthesis Ch. 10 (Blackwell Science, Oxford, 1997).
- Zeis, E. G. The fumarolic incrustations in the valley of ten thousand smokers. Nat. Geol. Soc. Cont. Tech. Papers, Katmai Series 1, no. 3 (National Geographic Society, Washington, 1924).
- 24. Yoder, H. S. High–low quartz inversion up to 10,000 bars. Trans. Am. Geophys. Union 31, 821–835 (1950).
- 25. Kullerud, G. & Yoder, H. S. Pyrite stability in the Fe–S system. Econ. Geol. 54, 534–550 (1959).
 - Strickland, J. D. H. & Parsons, T. R. A Practical Handbook of Seawater Analysis (Fisheries Research Board of Canada, Ottawa, 1972).
 - 27. Jones, M. N. Nitrate reduction by shaking with cadmium. Water Res. 18, 643-646 (1984)
 - Yoder, H. S. & Tilley, C. E. Origin of basalt magmas: an experimental study of natural and synthetic rock systems. J. Petrol. 3, 342–532 (1962).

Acknowledgements. We thank M. L. Fogel, D. Rumble, C. Prewitt and C. Chyba for helpful discussion of this work. Benjamin Cooper, a summer intern at the Carnegie Institution, was killed in an car accident during the completion of research on this project; this paper is dedicated to his memory. This work was supported by NASA.

Correspondence and requests for materials should be addressed to J.A.B. (e-mail: brandes@gl.ciw.edu).

Quantification of dust-forced heating of the lower troposphere

P. Alpert*, Y. J. Kaufman†, Y. Shay-El*, D. Tanre‡, A. da Silva§, S. Schubert§ & J. H. Joseph*

* Department of Geophysics and Planetary Sciences, Tel-Aviv University, Israel 69978

† Climate and Radiation Branch, Code 913, NASA/GSFC, Greenbelt, Maryland 20771, USA

‡ Laboratoire d'Optique Atmosphérique, Bât. P5, UST de Lille,

59655-Villeneuve d'Ascq Cedex, France

§ Data Assimilation Office, Code 910.3, NASA/GSFC, Greenbelt, Maryland 20771, USA

Aerosols may affect climate through the absorption and scattering of solar radiation and, in the case of large dust particles, by interacting with thermal radiation¹⁻³. But whether atmospheric temperature responds significantly to such forcing has not been determined; feedback mechanisms could increase or decrease the effects of the aerosol forcing. Here we present an indirect measure of the tropospheric temperature response by explaining the 'errors' in the NASA/Goddard model/data-assimilation system. These errors, which provide information about physical processes

NATURE VOL 395 24 SEPTEMBER 1998

letters to nature